

## GERMAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MINUTES

Tuesday, September 5, 2017  
4:00 p.m.

German Village Meeting Haus – 588 S. Third Street

**Commissioners Present:** Charissa W. Durst (arrived 4:09/Agenda Item #1), Jeff Ferriell, Anthony Hartke, Karen McCoy, Mark Ours, James Panzer

**Commissioners Absent:** Ned Thiell

**City Staff Present:** Connie Torbeck

**German Village Society Staff Present:** Nancy Kotting

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:06 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, September 26 2017 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Conference Room A.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, October 3, 2017 – 588 South Third Street
- IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Wednesday, August 1, 2017  
MOTION: Ours/Hartke (5-0-0) APPROVED
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS – The German Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.  
MOTION: Hartke/Ours (5-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

### STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

#### 1. 17-9-36

##### 311 East Beck Street (Beck Place Condos)

##### Brian Stroh (Applicant/Owner)

*Following presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-9-36, 311 East Beck Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

##### Install New Skylights

- Install up to five new skylights in the flat roof, per the submitted photographs and product cut sheet.
- New skylights to be Solatube 290 DS (12" above roof surface) or Solatube 160 DS (11" above roof surface).



- Final number of skylights and model number to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

MOTION: Hartke/Durst (6-0-0) APPROVED

**2. 17-9-37**

**796 South Fifth Street**

**Everlasting Roofing (Applicant)**

**Scott Motley (Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-9-37, 796 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Metal Roof

- Remove the existing asphalt shingles on the dormer on the south slope of the main roof.
- Remove the existing, asphalt shingles on the two, frame door hoods above the two south elevation entrances.
- Install standing-seam-metal roofing on the dormer and two door hoods. Color to be “Matte Black.”
- Metal panels to be smooth, 24 gauge, 16” wide o.c.
- Seams on door hoods to be 1” high.
- Seams on dormer to be 1 3/4” high.
- Final cut sheet/specifications to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for the file.
- The existing slate on the main roof is to remain, as is.

MOTION: Ours/Hartke (6-0-0) APPROVED

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

**3. 17-9-38**

**847 South Fifth Street**

**Juliet Bullock Architects, LLC. (Applicant)**

**Branko Pfeifer (Owner)**

Upon review of Application #17-9-38, 847 South Fifth Street, the German Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variance(s), as modified by the Applicant:

Request for Variance Recommendation

1. 3391.05 Limits to modifications of nonconforming structures. The existing square footage is 1012.1 sf and the new addition square footage is 1012.1 sf. Allowable limit is 506.05 sf.
2. 3332.26(E)(1) ~~Garage minimum sideyard. To allow a detached garage to be 16” to rear property line in lieu of 3’ required (#2 withdrawn).~~
3. 3321.05 (B) Vision Clearance To allow vision clearance of 7’-8 1/4” in lieu of the 10’ required.

MOTION: Ours/McCoy (6-0-0) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

Reasons for Recommendation:

- 1) Based on plans previously approved by the German Village Commission; 2) The principal residence is non-conforming due to the north sideyard; 3) The proposed garage is in line with development patterns for this block.

**4. 17-9-39 (Conceptual)**

**733 South Sixth Street**

**Juliet Bullock Architects, LLC. (Applicant)**

**Dustin & Lauren Blake (Owner)**

New Addition

- Construct a new, half-story addition with shed dormers at the rear of the existing dwelling, atop the existing, one-story addition, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Dormers to include single-lite, casement windows.
- Rear /west elevation to include paired, one-over-one, double-hung sash windows on the first and half story.
- Rear entrance to include French doors with transom and concrete stoop with metal railings.

Demolition

- Demolish the existing, non-contributing garage (built after 1976).

New Garage

- Construct a new, detached, frame, two-car garage at the rear of the property, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- New garage to have horizontal wood siding.
- Asphalt shingles to be from the approved roofing shingles list.
- Garage to include a single, one-over-one, double-hung sash window and a half-lite pedestrian door on the east elevation.

*Following presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicant in preparing for further review.*

Commissioner Panzer:

- The connection of the dormers to the roof ridge is tighter than traditionally approved.
- It's strange to see larger windows (on the second floor) above smaller windows (on the first floor).
- A casement that looks like a double-hung, with off-set lights, would be okay for the second story (for egress).

Commissioner Hartke:

- Asked about how the new wood siding on the addition will align with the existing siding.

Commissioner Ours:

- The casings on the second story windows are too close to the gable trim.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**5. 17-9-40**

**1000 Jaeger Street**

**Juliet Bullock Architects, LLC. (Applicant)**

**Larry Lehring (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant and property owner, Application #17-9-40 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action.*

MOTION: Hartke/McCoys (6-0-0) DIVISION APPROVED

**17-9-40a**

*Following presentation by the Applicant and property owner and additional discussion and review, the following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-9-40a, 1000 Jaeger Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Demolition/House

- Remove the existing, one-story, frame, rear addition on the two-story frame house.
- Remove second story exterior wall.

*Note: The existing rear addition has been highly modified and retains little historic fabric or historic integrity.*

New Addition/House

- Build a new, one-and-one-half story, frame addition and porch on rear elevation, per the submitted drawings.
- Build new, one-story connector.
- Exterior cladding to be wood siding, to match original siding, per the submitted drawings.
- Roofing to be asphalt shingles to match existing house.
- New windows to be Pella, all wood (interior/exterior) casements.
- New doors on east and north elevations to be full-light.
- Foundation to be plain-face concrete block.
- Porch to include square, wood columns to match front porch columns, and wood railings.
- Gutters to be ogee/K-style.

- Final drawings and cut sheets for doors, windows, and any exterior light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

MOTION: Hartke/Durst (6-0-0) APPROVED

### **17-9-40b**

Continue Application # 17-9-40b, 1000 Jaeger Street, for demolition of the existing garage and construction of a new garage, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the October 3, 2017 German Village Commission agenda.

Commissioner Comments:

- Garage gutters should match the house gutters.
- Please submit an alleyscape for the next review.
- The pedestrian door may be fiberglass or aluminum.
- The overhead garage doors may be metal with wood overlay.

MOTION: Hartke/Durst (6-0-0) CONTINUED

### **6. 17-9-41 (Conceptual)**

#### **113 Thurman Avenue**

**Juliet Bullock Architects, LLC. (Applicant)**

**Crescent G. Medley (Owner)**

#### New Carriage House

- Second conceptual review for construction of a new, one-and-one-half story carriage house at the rear of the lot.
- Second story space to include a bedroom/office space and bath.
- Exterior cladding to be 5 1/4" HardiBoard.
- Windows to be aluminum-clad, one-over-one, double-hung sash.
- Pedestrian doors on north elevation to be two-panel.
- Two overhead doors on south elevation to be metal, carriage style.
- Access easement via existing parking lot is in place.

*Following presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.*

#### Commissioner Panzer:

- Asked whether any Commissioner had issues with the concept of a carriage house at this location. No objections were raised.
- Noted that HardieBoard has been approved by the Commission on secondary structures with 3/4" sheathing for stability.
- Clad windows have not typically been approved by the Commission.
- Overhead garage doors on the alley would need to be wood or metal with wood overlay.

#### Commissioner Ours:

- Noted that clad windows have been approved as a test case but Ours had voted against. Briefly spoke of the issue of rotting wood with wood windows.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**7. 17-9-42**

**113 Thurman Avenue**

**Juliet Bullock Architects, LLC. (Applicant)**

**Crescent G. Medley (Owner)**

Upon review of Application #17-9-42, 113 Thurman Avenue, the German Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variance(s), as submitted:

Request for Variance Recommendation

LOT AREA 4788 SF

HOUSE FOOTPRINT 1054 SF

GARAGE FOOT PRINT 716.7

REARYARD FOR HOUSE IS 2254.243 SF

1. 3312.13 DRIVEWAY, TO ALLOW A DRIVEWAY TO BE ACCESSED FROM A PRIVATE LOT, RATHER THAN A PUBLIC RIGHT OF WAY.
2. 3312.25 MANUEVERING, TO ALLOW FOR MANUERVERING ON ADJACENT PARCEL.
3. 3332.38(H) TO ALLOW FOR HABITABLE SPACE OVER THE GARAGE.
4. 3333.38(G) GARAGE HEIGHT TO ALLOWED TO EXCEED 15', WHEREAS THE APPLICANT PROPOSED 28' FOR FINISHED SPACE THAT INCLUDES A BATH BUT NO KITCHEN

MOTION: Durst/Hartke (6-0-0) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

Reasons for Recommendation:

Items 1 & 2 are existing conditions; Items 3 & 4 are consistent with development patterns for the area.

**8. 17-9-43 (Conceptual)**

**253 Lansing Street**

**Juliet Bullock Architects, LLC. (Applicant)**

**Patrick & Sarah Ahern (Owner)**

New Addition

- Construct a new, one-story addition to the rear on the existing, one-story, non-historic portion of the one-and-one-half-story, frame house.
- Materials to be wood siding /asphalt shingles from approved list.
- New windows to be wood, one-over-one, double-hung sash windows.
- Modify existing side porch with new columns.

*Following presentation by the Applicant and property owner, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.*

Commissioner Panzer:

- It appears that little or no part of the original rear additions exists.
- Understands the effort to break down the length by providing a cross gable, but don't know if that's needed.
- Will be concerned with how the proposed addition will look from the public way.

Commissioner Ours:

- The 1995 photo shows the sections of the rear additions that were being demolition. The existing addition is only a facsimile of what was there.
- A roof plan would be helpful for the next review to provide a better understanding of the massing.
- If the cross gable is just an attic, it may not be necessary. Once you start turning the roof of the addition, it's not subservient anymore.
- Off-setting two gables could possibly mitigate the height.

Commissioner Durst:

- There is only an altered portion of one of the original rear additions remaining.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**9. 17-9-44 (Conceptual)**

**1033-1037 City Park Avenue**

**Juliet Bullock Architects, LLC. (Applicant)**

**David Neiderhiser/Northsteppe Realty (Owner)**

Remove Exterior Stairs

- Remove the existing, non-original, exterior, metal stairs on the front of the building.

Install new Balconies/East Elevation

- Install two (2), new balconies with metal railings, at the two (2) existing, second-floor entrances on the façade, per the submitted drawings.

Remove Overhang/West Elevation

- Remove the existing, non-original, frame overhang on the rear/west elevation.

Parking Area

- Remove gravel from the existing, rear parking area.
- Install new brick paver parking area, per the submitted site plan.

*Following presentation by the Applicant and property owner, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.*

Commissioner Panzer:

- Each side of the duplex has an inset porch. Adding a third porch would not be appropriate.
- Asked Commissioners whether removing the stairs and adding Juliet balconies would be a step in the right direction until full restoration is done some time in the future.

Commissioner McCoy:

- Thinks a Juliet balcony could be a temporary step in the right direction.

Commissioner Hartke:

- Knee braces or some other support would also be needed for balconies, so that would add more holes to the façade.
- Thinks it is better to leave the existing metal stairs in place for the time being, rather than adding any type of balcony.

Commissioner Ours:

- Asked how the existing, rear shed overhang is tied into the main structure and if the rear wall of the main structure would just be tuck-pointed following removal.
- The existing stairs/landing and door modification on the façade was such an inappropriate change. Removing it and installing balconies on the façade would only draw more attention to it. It would be like, "Two wrongs don't make a right."
- Whenever the stairs are removed, it will need to be a restoration of the original window openings with new stone sills. Would rather see the stairs stay for the time being rather than install inappropriate balconies.
- A single balcony rather than two would not be appropriate either. Possibly if it were on the rear elevation.
- Even though installation of balconies would get rid of the inappropriate stairs, the stairs are an obvious, inappropriate, and utilitarian addition. The proposed balconies will look like an ornamental architectural feature on a primary façade.

Commissioner Durst:

- Thinks a Juliet balcony could be a temporary step in the right direction if only the width of the door.

Commissioner Ferriell:

- Could support installation of Juliet balconies as a step in the right direction toward restoration only because the existing stairs are such a problem. Few if any original balconies exist on the front of buildings in the village.

**NO ACTION TAKEN**

**10. 17-9-46**

**475 South Third Street**

**William D. Dargusch/ Metropolitan Partners (Applicant)**

**Metropolitan GV LLC. (Owner)**

**Metropolitan GV, LLC. (Applicant/Owners)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-9-46, 475 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install Permanent Signage Frame

- Install one (1), new, wall mounted, beveled tension frame, secured to brick wall with mechanical fasteners.
- HDU panel to be 10" High x 2" Deep x 12' Wide, with carved, V-Groove, gold leaf letters, reading "GERMAN VILLAGE."
- Banners to be displayed in frames with viewable opening of 67.36 sq. ft.
- Frame to be painted dark green to match building trim color.
- HDU panel to be black.
- V-Groove letters to be 22 kt gold leaf.

MOTION: Ours/Durst (0-6-0) APPROVAL DENIED

Reason(s) for Denial:

- Wall murals, large advertising and co-op signs, and rooftop signs are not permitted.  
(“Guidelines for Graphics and Signage” *German Village Guidelines*, p.126, 4<sup>th</sup> Bullet).

**11. 17-9-47**

**210-220 Thurman Avenue**

**C.J. Andrews/mode architects (Applicant)**

**Thurman Partners, LLC. (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application #17-9-47, Commissioner Ours noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings, and exited the hearing room.*

Approve Application 17-9-47, 210-220 Thurman Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install a new, 6'H, wood privacy fence at the rear of the house at 220 Thurman Avenue, per the submitted photograph and site plan.
- New fence to be board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut (not dog-eared or stockade), wood fence with finished side out, facing the parking lot (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside).
- Gate with vision panel to be located per the submitted site plan.
- New fence and gate to be painted/stained within one year.
- Install new concrete stoop and step to access new gate, per the submitted site plan.

MOTION: Hartke/McCoy (5-0-1 [Ours]) APPROVED

**12. 17-9-48**

**130 East Kossuth Street**

**Marvin Windows of Ohio (Applicant)**

**Marjorie Yano (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application #17-9-48, Commissioner Ours returned to the table. Following presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-9-48, 130 East Kossuth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Windows

- Remove the existing, twelve (12), non-original, wooden, one-over-one, double-hung sash windows, per the submitted photographs.
- Remove existing, aluminum storm windows.
- Install new, Marvin, Wood Ultimate double-hung windows, per the submitted product specifications.

- New windows to fit the historic window openings.
- Existing, wooden, arched window headers to remain or to be replicated exactly.
- One window in rear dormer and one smaller window on rear elevation to remain.

MOTION: Hartke/McCoy (6-0-0) APPROVED

**13. 17-9-49**

**702-706 Lazelle Street**

**Thomas J. Duffy, Sr. (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-9-49, 702-706 Lazelle Street, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Repair Box Gutters

- Make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on the south elevation of the brick cottage with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile to match existing, like-for-like.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

*Note: The original box gutter on the north elevation was previously removed and replaced with ogee/k-style gutters at an unknown time by a previous owner.*

MOTION: Ours/McCoy (6-0-0) APPROVED

**14. 17-9-50**

**37 East Deshler Avenue**

**Rachel Levine & John Rogers (Applicant)**

**Rachel Levine (Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-9-50, 37 East Deshler Avenue, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Landscape/Hardscape

- Remove existing hedges along front property line.
- Install new square cut, regular coursed, 6-8" high stone wall along front property line, similar to the existing wall at 15-23 E. Deshler Avenue.
- Install new brick paver patio at rear of driveway, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new plantings, per the submitted plan.
- Install new, wood privacy fence and gate at rear of driveway to conceal new patio, per the submitted elevation drawing.
- Revised drawing and stone type and color to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Hartke/Durst (6-0-0) APPROVED



**15. 17-9-51**

**700 Mohawk Street**

**Will Lehnert/Outdoor Space Design (Applicant)**

**Art & Natalia Roca (Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-9-51, 700 Mohawk Street, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Remove Brick Steps & Install Limestone Steps

- Remove the three (3) existing, non-original, brick steps at the northern front entrance. Steps at southern front entrance were previously approved for removal in 2006.
- Install new, limestone steps at front entrance, per the submitted example photograph.
- Stoop to be constructed of Indiana limestone and Ottawa limestone.

Install Retaining Edge

- Install a 7" high limestone curb along public sidewalk on front/west and north property line, per the submitted drawings.
- Curb to be a 12" x 6" Indiana limestone set on aggregate base, with 7" exposure above ground.

Install New Wrought Iron Fence

- Install new, 36" high, Fortin F20S, wrought iron fence, to match property to the south, per the submitted drawings.
- New fence to extend along property line along Alexander Alley and Mohawk Street, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawing.
- One gate to align with the northernmost window on the façade.

Landscaping

- Install new landscaping in the front and side yards, per the submitted site plan.

Repair Brick Sidewalk

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, brick public sidewalk, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new or used brick in the same location and of the same pattern and dimensions.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.
- All work within the public right-of-way to be coordinated with the Department of Public Service.

MOTION: Durst/Hartke (6-0-0) APPROVED

**16. 17-9-52**

**306 East Sycamore Street**

**Teresa J. Dalenta (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-9-52, 306 East Sycamore Street, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Rooftop Patio Railing

- Remove the existing wood railings on the roof above the enclosed, rear porch, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new, wood railings, like-for-like, based on the example drawing provided by HPO staff (*Columbus Register Architectural Guidelines*, p. 15). Existing metal caps will not be reinstalled.
- New railings to be painted or stained.

Install New Windows/Rear Porch

- Remove the existing screen in the ca. 1985, enclosed rear porch, per the submitted photographs.
- Install five (5) new, wood windows in the existing screen openings.
- Paint new windows to match existing porch color.

MOTION: Hartke/McCoy (6-0-0) APPROVED

**17. 17-9-53**

**577 Cedar Alley**

**William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)**

**Larry & Julie Angell (Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-9-53, 577 Cedar Alley, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Boral Siding

- Install new Tyvek house wrap.
- Install new Boral siding, 1x6, cove/Dutch lap over existing wood siding, to match existing reveal and profile, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- New windows (COA # 17-9-32) will be set outward to compensate for the additional layers of Tyvek and Boral siding, to provide for traditional trim depth and shadow lines.

*Note: Boral siding is being approved as a test case at this particular property, because of the way the original wood siding was installed (with no sheathing) and the condition of the original wood siding. The house is not sustainable as it is.*

MOTION: Hartke/McCoy (6-0-0) APPROVED

**18. 17-9-54**

**179 East Deshler Avenue**

**William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)**

**Chip & Julie Burke (Owners)**

*Prior to review of Application #17-9-54, Commissioner Ours noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings, and exited the hearing room.*

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-9-54, 179 East Deshler Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Build New Rear Porch

- Remove the existing, approximately 300 sq. ft., ca. 2000 pergola structure on the rear elevation of the house, per the submitted photograph.
- Build a new, rear porch in same footprint, per the submitted drawings.
- New porch to include three (3) Velux skylights.
- New porch to include Boral trim, throughout. Color to match existing house trim.
- Roof to be flat-seamed, copper or EPDM system.

MOTION: Hartke/McCoy (5-0-1 [Ours]) APPROVED

**19. 17-9-55**

**179 East Deshler Avenue**

**Sue Grant (Applicant)**

**Christopher Burke & Julia Backoff (Owners)**

*Commissioner Ours continued to recuse himself from the proceedings for Application # 17-9-55, 179 East Deshler Avenue.*

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application 17-9-55, 179 East Deshler Avenue, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

New Retaining Wall

- Install a new, 24" high, brick retaining wall, with limestone cap, in front yard, per the submitted drawings.
- Cap to be cut stone with a 3" minimum height.
- Taller plantings to be placed in front of the new wall to allow for approximately one-foot wall exposure.
- Wall cheeks returning to sidewalk to be minimized in size and by plantings as much as possible.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Hartke/Durst (5-0-1 [Ours]) APPROVED

## **CONCEPTUAL REVIEW**

### **20. 17-9-56**

**827 City Park Avenue**

**Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)**

**Evan & Kim Sauer (Owners)**

*Prior to review of Application #17-9-56, Commissioner Ours returned to the table.*

#### Demolition

- Demolish the existing, one-story, concrete block rear addition.

#### New Addition

- Build new, one-and-one-half story rear addition with one-story connector, per the submitted drawings.
- Windows to be one-over-one, double-hung sash.

*Following presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.*

#### Commissioner Ours:

- Thinks the revised proposal is much better and appropriate. It now looks like it belongs on the site.
- If windows are to be changed on the existing house, it would be better to use simple one-over-ones.
- Can live with the 54.2% lot coverage. The hardship is there.
- Thinks the grouping of windows on the addition is a good effort at differentiating it from the principal structure and historic fabric. It's skillfully crafted.

#### Commissioner Hartke:

- Has some concerns about the 54.2% lot coverage.
- Noted, however, that there can never be a garage on this property unless they get an easement through another property.

#### Commissioner McCoy:

- Does not have concerns with the 54.2% lot coverage.

#### Commissioner Panzer:

- Acknowledged that adding onto cottages is a challenge, especially with issues of lot coverage.
- This is a land-locked lot, so the rear yard can never be covered anyway.
- In terms of open space, the remaining 45.8% will always be open space.
- The window groupings are not traditional, but play off of the windows on the existing dormer.

NO ACTION TAKEN

### **21. 17-9-56**

**503 South Third Street**

**Charles Willoughby & Jon Halverstadt (Applicants/Owners)**

#### Demolition/New Construction/Garage

- Demolish the existing garage and build a new, two-car garage.
- Modify existing curb cut to allow for new, two-car garage.

#### New Roof

- Remove the existing slate roof, and install new, asphalt roof.

#### New Windows

- Remove existing windows and install new wood windows.

#### General Repairs

- Install exterior railings, as required.
- Install new gutters/downspouts.
- Re-point masonry.
- Repair/replace any deteriorated wood trim and paint exterior.

*Following presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicants in preparing for further review.*

Commissioner Hartke:

- This proposal appears to gain one parking space on Third and lose one space on Blenkner, so it would be a one-for-one trade off of parking plus an off-site parking spot.
- Not sure that a two-car garage would fit in this space.

Commissioner Panzer:

- The first consideration is the demolition of the existing garage. The Commission should not consider that getting something better is a sufficient reason for demolition.
- Generally, two garage doors are required if space allows.
- A tandem garage may work on this site.

Commissioner Ours:

- Based on the staff report, the garage that is there now is not original to the house, but is old. Need to see a structural engineer's report to determine the structural integrity of the concrete block wall and rest of the garage.
- Given the evidence presented so far, is leaning toward allowing the garage to come off.
- Has concerns about whether a new two-car garage would fit on the lot, as some sort of connector would be needed to differentiate a new garage from the historic house – a connector that does not exist now.
- Need more information regarding the total width of a new garage, the proposed doors, etc. That will require a lot more study.

Commissioner Durst:

- In agreement with Commissioner Ours' comments.

Commissioner McCoy:

- In general agreement with Commissioner Ours.
- If demolition of the existing garage is approved, will need to consider the setback of the garage and a large garage door on Blenkner is not really desirable. It will need to be sensitively done.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**STAFF APPROVALS**

*(The following applicants are not required to attend)*

• **17-9-1**

**724 Macon Alley**

**Lauren Bandman (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-1, 724 Macon Alley, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Replace any damaged/deteriorated, exterior siding with new fiber-cement siding shingles, as needed, to match existing size, texture, and profile.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be: Body – Benjamin Moore HC-154, "Hale Navy;" Trim – "White," to match existing trim color.

- **17-9-2**

**784 South Fifth Street****Barbara McCready/Horcher Family Partnership (Applicant)****Horcher Family Partnership (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-2, 784 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood siding and/or trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood siding and/or trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be: Body – Gray/Green to match existing body color; Trim – “White,” to match existing trim color.
- Paint color chips to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for the file.
- The unpainted stone foundation is to remain unpainted.

- **17-9-3**

**360 East Beck Street****Everlasting Roofing (Applicant)****Joe Meranda (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-3, 360 East Beck Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the rear addition, down to the sheathing, per the submitted roof plan. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys. Reflash existing skylight.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:Style:Color:☐ CertainTeed

Carriage House (dimensional)

☐ Stonegate Gray☐ GAF

Slateline (dimensional)

☐ English Gray Slate☐ Weathered Slate☐ Certain Teed

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Nickel Gray☐ GAF

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

☐ Nickel Gray☐ Owens Corning

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Estate Gray☐ Tamko

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner's Red.”

- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner's Red.”

- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Repair Slate Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated slate on the main roof of the house with new or used slate of the same color and profile and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

• **17-9-4**

**804 Jaeger Street**

**Todd & Heather Leonard (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-4, 804 Jaeger Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof and front porch of the house, down to the sheathing.
- Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be from the approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

[ ] GAF

Slateline (dimensional)

[ ] English Gray Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **17-9-5**

**626 South Fifth Street**

**Anthony Wayne Meyer & Thomas Tyler Mason (Applicants/Owners)**

Approve Application #17-9-5, 626 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be: Body – Sherwin Williams, SW7074, "Software;" Trim/Windows/Door – Restoration Hardware, "Charcoal," per the submitted paint color chips.
- Unpainted, stone foundation to remain unpainted.

- **17-9-6**

**144 East Whittier Street**

**Pat Ryan/Ryan Brothers Landscaping (Applicant)**

**Jon Politi (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-6, 144 East Whittier Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair Brick Sidewalk

- Remove and retain the existing “bullseye” brick of the existing public sidewalk.
- Remove tree roots and regrade, as needed.
- Any root or tree removal or tree replacement within the tree lawn is to be done in coordination with the City Forester/Dept. of Recreation and Parks.
- Install two, new planting beds with stone borders at the front of the house, per the submitted drawing and product example photo.
- Reinstall the original “bullseye” brick in same location and of the same dimensions as the existing sidewalk. Use original brick from the newly created planting beds to replace any missing or deteriorated “bullseye” brick.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

- **17-9-7**

**760 South Third Street**

**Glen Sullivan (Applicant)**

**Ted Ryan (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-7, 760 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Patio Door

- Remove the existing, deteriorated patio doors with two side lites and four transom windows on the rear elevation of the 1991 rear addition.
- Install new, Sierra Pacific, aluminum-clad, wood patio door system with two side lites and four transom windows to match existing, per the submitted product specifications.
- New door to fit within the existing opening.
- Exterior color to be “Sandstone.”
- Exterior, decorative crown molding to match existing.

- **17-9-8**

**193 East Beck Street**

**Susan Sutherland (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-8, 193 East Beck Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

New Window Boxes

- Install two (2) new, black, fiberglass window boxes on the first floor front elevation and two (2) on the first floor west elevation, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- Window boxes to be centered on window opening.
- New window boxes may be installed by direct mount, cleat mount or with wall brackets.

- **17-9-9**

**625 Mohawk Street**

**Jeff Ihlenfield (Applicant)**

**Chris Martin (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-9, 625 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Front Door

- Remove the existing, non-original, non-contributing, four-panel and fanlight door on the façade.
- Install a new, Simpson, four-panel, wood door, per the submitted product cut sheet.

Install New Garage Door

- Remove the existing, deteriorated, wood, raised panel, overhead garage door, per the submitted photograph.

- Install a new, Clopay Classic Wood (cedar), Model 44, raised panel, overhead garage door, per the submitted product cut sheet. Style to be “Solid Long,” with no windows.

Install New Window

- Remove the one (1), existing, non-original, non-contributing, vinyl window on the rear elevation of the house.
- Install one (1) new, Pella Architect Series, wood, one-over-one, double-hung sash window in the same window opening.

Exterior Painting / House & Garage

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the brick cottage, dormer, and frame rear addition for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint color scheme to be as follows: Wood siding – Sherwin Williams HGSW1494, “Pussywillow;” Stair rail and rear steps – HGSW1492, “Thunderclap;” Window and door trim, window sash, fascia, and soffit: HGSW1491, “Peppercorn.”
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., stone sills and lintels, stone foundation and water table, and concrete block garage walls) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

• **17-9-10**

**326 East Sycamore Street**

**Brian Bush (Applicant)**

**Brian & Alison Bush (Owners)**

Approve Application #17-9-10, 326 East Sycamore Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the existing wood privacy fence along the north and west sides of the property, and install a new six-foot high (6’ H), wood privacy fence in the same location.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6’ H), straight-cut (not dog-eared or stockade) wood fence with finished side out, facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6’ H), straight-cut (not dog-eared or stockade) wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6’ H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Location of gates to be same as existing.

Install New Half-Round Gutters

- Remove the existing, deteriorated, half-round gutters and downspouts, and dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension, as needed.
- Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color.
- Install new, 5", half-round metal gutters and new round, metal down spouts of the appropriate dimension. Finish color to match the existing trim color.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the



foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

- **17-9-11**

**752 City Park Avenue**

**Rob Dilger (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-11, 752 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting / House

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the brick cottage, dormer, and frame rear addition for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color scheme to be as follows: Wood siding – Sherwin Williams SW7045, "Intellectual Gray;" Trim – SW7069, "Iron Ore."
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick exterior walls, stone sills and lintels, stone foundation and water table, and concrete block garage walls) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **17-9-12**

**475 South Third Street**

**Signcom Inc. (Applicant)**

**Metropolitan Partners (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-12, 475 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install Temporary Sign

- Install one (1) new, single-faced, "for lease" sign, on the existing fence, facing toward Livingston Avenue.
- Sign material is .5" thick MDO durably panel, filled, primed, and painted with exterior grade enamels.
- Graphics are high performance vinyl, applied directly to panel.
- Sign measures 3'9" x 7'6" (28.13 sq. ft.).
- Sign secured to fence with four (4) pipe post brackets.
- Lease sign includes company name and contact information and type of space to be leased, and does not include the address of any property to be leased.
- Colors to be as follows: Background –Black & White; Graphics – Black & White; Photo Image – Digital Print.
- Temporary sign to be removed no later than ninety (90) days following the issuance of this Certificate of Appropriateness.

- **17-9-13**

**759 South Sixth Street**

**Bello Giardino Landscaping (Applicant)**

**Lynette Woda (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-13, 759 South Sixth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Painting/Wrought Iron Fence

- Prepare all metal surfaces for repainting by removing any/all rust and loose paint with appropriate hand tools.
- Solid prime any/all bare metal with exterior metal primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Apply two (2) finish coats to the clean, dust-free metal fence components in accordance to manufacturer's specifications. Finish color to be "Black," to match existing.

Replace Stone Curbing

- Remove the existing, deteriorated sandstone curbing and non-original brick curbing in front of the property, along South Sixth Street.
- Install new or used sandstone curbing, like-for-like, in accordance with Columbus City Code and in consultation with the Department of Public Service.

• **17-9-14**

**839 Mohawk Street**

**Ken Helmlinger (Applicant)**

**Frieda Hoheisel (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-14, 839 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Landscaping

- Install new landscape and hardscape in rear/west yard and south side yard to replace landscaping and hardscapes removed during construction of a new addition.
- Install new brick patio areas in the rear/west yard and south side yard, per the submitted site plan. Pavers to be Belden Belcrest 560 pavers.
- Install new stepping stones between side and rear yard patios.
- Install new plantings, per the submitted landscape plan.
- Install new water feature on south elevation, to be no taller than 4'H.
- Install short section of new, iron fence with gate, extending southward from the south wall of the house, per the submitted site plan. New fence design to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Existing wood fence on north side of rear yard to remain.

• **17-9-15**

**51-53 East Stewart Avenue**

**Mark K. Merkle, Jr. (Applicant)**

**Stewart Avenue Property Co., LLC. (Owner)**

Approve Application 17-9-15, 51-53 East Stewart Avenue, for renewal of expired COA # 12-7-24 (Expired: July 10, 2013), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Replace Awning

- Replace deteriorated barrel style awning and frame with new flat, "shed style" canvas awning and metal frame, per submitted rendering and specifications.
- The new awning will have the only the address on the front valence, no other text or signage.

MOTION: Ours/O'Donnell (7-0-0) APPROVED

• **17-9-16**

**929 South Third Street**

**True North Rentals/Northsteppe Realty (Applicant)**

**True North Rentals (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-16, 929 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the rear portion of the house and the garage, down to the sheathing, per the submitted roof plan. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be from the approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

[ ] Owens Corning

(standard 3-tab)

[ ] Estate Gray

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.
- **No repair or replacement of slate on the front section of the house is being requested or approved at this time.**

- **17-9-17**

**227 East Sycamore Street**

**Javier Invernizzi (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-17, 227 East Sycamore Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Landscaping

- Add approximately six (6) new plants to the existing front yard planting bed, per the submitted plantings list.
- Remove existing stone and gravel from rear yard, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new sod in rear yard, as needed, and add new plantings, per the submitted plantings list.
- Planting of new trees within the tree lawn/r-o-w to be coordinated with the City Forester/Department of Recreation and Parks.

- **17-9-18**

**796 South Fifth Street**

**Everlasting Roofing (Applicant)**

**Scott Motley (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-18, 796 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Half-Round Gutters

- Remove the existing, non-original, ogee gutters and corrugated down spouts, and dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary.
- Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Install new, 5", half-round metal gutters and new round, metal down spouts of the appropriate dimension. Finish color to match the existing trim color.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

- **17-9-19**

**1093-1107 South Fourth Street**

**Connie & Marshall Swain (Applicant)**

**Fourth Thurman Property, LLC. (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-19, 1093-1107 South Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting/Brick Six-Unit Building

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the brick, multi-family residential building for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.

- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color to be Sherwin Williams SW6150 "Universal Khaki."
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., exterior brick walls and porch columns; concrete window sills, and porch coping, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**

- **17-9-20**

**629 Mohawk Street**

**Rhonda Phillips/Rugh's Remodeling (Applicant)**

**Scott Reich (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-20, 629 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main block and rear, gabled addition to the house, down to the sheathing, per the submitted roof plan. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be from the approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

[ ] Owens Corning

(standard 3-tab)

[ ] Estate Gray

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **17-9-21**

**259-263 East Whittier Street**

**Scott Heimlich/Barcelona Restaurant (Applicant)**

**Weiler Bowen Ltd. (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-21, 259-263 East Whittier Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install Temporary Tent / Patio Enclosure

- Install a fifteen by thirty foot (15' x 30'), frame tent on existing enclosed patio portion of Barcelona Restaurant, per submitted site plan and specifications.
- Existing patio is partially covered by a permanent wood awning and enclosed by a 5-foot fence with one exit gate.
- Temporary tent enclosure to sit against existing, wood awning.
- Tent to be installed as a temporary structure, and will remain in place from October 30, 2017 through January 4, 2018.

*Note: A temporary tent at this location has been approved annually since 2006.*

- **17-9-22**

**562 South Sixth Street**

**Klaus Gauer (Applicant)**

**Jeanne Gauer (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-22, 562 South Sixth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the, house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Power wash existing aluminum siding with a maximum pressure of 300 lb./p. s. i. and broad fan tip nozzle, as needed.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be: Body - Sherwin Williams SW7046 "Anonymous;" Trim – SW6258 "Tricorn Black."
- **Any previously unpainted masonry is to remain unpainted.**

- **17-9-23**

**238 ½ Whittier Street**

**Mary McClain (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-23, 238 ½ East Whittier Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Repair Asphalt Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated asphalt shingles on the east/left slope of the main roof with new asphalt shingles to match existing, in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

- **17-9-24**

**571 South Third Street**

**Rob Harris/Roth Construction (Applicant)**

**Gute-Laune LLC. (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-24, 571 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Repair Concrete Block & Stucco

- Repair the brick and stucco, one-story, rear addition damaged by a fallen tree, per the submitted photographs.
- Remove the existing awning on north elevation. Repair awning, as needed, and reinstall in same location following all repairs to building.
- Repair/replace all damaged and displaced concrete block at the northwest corner, as needed.
- Repair/replace all damaged and displaced stucco, as needed. New stucco to match the texture of existing stucco.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the flat roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color to match existing.
- Repair/replace all damaged and displaced, metal coping at roof, as needed. Colors to match existing.

- Repair/replace all damaged and displaced gutters and downspouts, as needed, in-like-kind.

- **17-9-25**

**195, 195 ½ & 197 Thurman Avenue**

**Lisa Pasko (Applicant)**

**David Cattee (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-25, 195, 195 ½ & 197 Thurman Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

- Remove all defective and non-original brick and mortar on the front and side of the brick commercial building, as needed. Replace any/all damaged and/or non-original brick with brick which matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be softer than the brick, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the brick. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements on the brick commercial building, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the brick commercial building for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for the file.
- **Any previously unpainted masonry is to remain unpainted.**

- **17-9-26**

**787 Mohawk Street**

**W. Michael & Cari Overfield (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-26, 787 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install a new six-foot high (6' H), wood privacy fence across the rear yard, per the submitted site plan.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be board-on-board, six-foot high (6' H), straight-cut (not dog-eared or stockade) wood fence, with finished side out, facing Lazelle Street (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside).
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Remove existing, wood gate at front of property, and install new, wood gate to match existing, per the submitted photos and site plan.

- **17-9-27**

**897-899 South Third Street**

**Michael J. Ferris (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-27, 897-899 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements on the brick commercial building, as needed. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the brick commercial building for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.

- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Paint wood storefront and trim on the brick building and the frame stairway enclosure with colors to match existing. Paint colors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for the file.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., exterior brick walls; stone window sills and lintels; stone pilaster capitals) is to remain unpainted.**
- One pilaster capital on the left side of the façade was previously painted "gray." The gray paint may be removed or left as is. No additional paint is to be applied.

- **17-9-28**

**252 Reinhard Avenue**

**Adam Borchers (Applicant)**

**Morrisco, LLC. (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-28, 252 Reinhard Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

New Satellite Dish

- Install a new satellite dish at the rear, northeast corner of the two-story, frame house, per the submitted photographs.
- New dish to be located in the position least visible from the public right-of-way, as noted in the photograph labeled "First – Second – Third Choice Option." Every effort should be made to place the new dish in the First or Second Choice option.

- **17-9-29**

**317 Jackson Street**

**Megan Hast (Applicant)**

**Griffin Stout (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-29, 317 Jackson Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install New Door

- Remove the existing, French door and transom on the rear elevation of the existing rear addition, per the submitted photograph.
- Install a new, wood, Marvin, French door and transom unit, per the submitted product specifications.
- New door system to fit within the existing opening.
- Paint new door system and exterior trim, as needed, to match existing colors.

- **17-9-30**

**38 Thurman Avenue**

**Betty A. Garrett (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-30, 38 Thurman Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install New Gate

- Remove the existing, non-contributing metal, walkway gate on the east side of the property, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new, wrought iron (steel) gate in same location, to match the walkway gate on the front/Thurman Avenue side of the property.
- New gate to be Fortin gate # WG-F5, per the submitted product cut sheet.

- **17-9-31**

**614 South Sixth Street**

**Susan Altan (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-31, 614 South Sixth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the existing, six and eight-foot high, wood privacy along the north side of the property, per the submitted photographs and survey plan.

- Install new, six and eight-foot high, wood privacy fence of same design and in the same location, as per the submitted site plan and specifications; like-for-like; in accordance with all applicable City Code.
- Eight foot section at rear of property to include latticework cap, to match existing.
- Retain and reinstall existing metal caps on top of wood caps.

- **17-9-32**

**577 Cedar Alley**

**William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)**

**Larry & Julie Angell (Owner)**

Approve Application 17-9-32, 577 Cedar Alley, for renewal of expired COA # 16-7-29b (Expired: July 6, 2017), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Replace Windows

- Remove all deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing windows on the house.
- Install new, Marvin, 2-over-2 SDL, all-wood, interior/exterior, windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

MOTION: Ours/Hartke (6-0-0) APPROVED

- **17-9-33**

**35 East Sycamore Street**

**Brent Foley (Applicant)**

**Jim Nichols (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-33, 35 East Sycamore Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install New Storm Door

- Install a new, Andersen, full-light, aluminum storm door on the rear entrance doorway of the new porch enclosure, per the submitted photographs and product cut sheet. Color to be “Bronze.”

Install New Awning

- Install a new standing-seam-metal awning above the rear entrance doorway of the new porch enclosure, per the submitted drawings. Color to be “Aged Bronze” with “Black” support brackets.

Install New Handrails

- Install new iron handrails on either side of the existing, front entrance steps, per the submitted photographs and drawings.
- Handrail profile to match existing metal flower box structure.
- Handrail pickets to match profile and spacing of existing, adjacent fence and gate (1/2” square).

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the section of 6’ H, wood privacy fence between 35 E. Sycamore and 33 E. Sycamore.
- Install new section of 6’H wood privacy fence, extending from the west wall of 35 E. Sycamore to the west property line, per the submitted site plan and section drawing.

Install New Planting Bed

- Remove a section of the brick public sidewalk directly in front of the house to create a new planting bed, per the submitted rendering.
- New planting bed to extend approximately 3 feet from the façade of the house and extend to the east end of the house, approximately 16 feet.
- Install and maintain new plantings.
- All work within the public right-of-way is to be coordinated with the Department of Public Service.
- Any new tree plantings within the tree lawn right-of-way is to be coordinated with the City Forester/Department of Recreation and Parks.



- **17-9-34**

**181 Thurman Avenue**

**Dan Morgan/Behal Sampson Dietz (Applicant)**

**Ben Goodman (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-34, 181 Thurman Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Remove Deck, Stairs, and Ramp

- Remove the existing, non-original, non-contributing, exterior stair system and canopy on the rear elevation, per the submitted photographs.
- Remove the existing aluminum entrance ramp on the rear elevation.
- All work to be completed in accordance with all applicable City Code.

Repair Siding

- Repair/replace the existing, non-original, vertical board siding on the frame addition, per the submitted photographs. New wood siding to match existing profile.
- Paint siding and trim, as needed, with color to match existing.

Install New Doors

- Remove the existing, steel, first floor, rear entry door and the existing, non-original, second floor entry door on the rear elevation.
- Install new, wood, three-quarter-light door on the first floor and full-light door on the second floor.
- Cut sheet for new doors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

Front Porch Repair

- Repair the non-original, front porch, including posts, railings, soffit, ceiling, and decking, as needed, with like material of same dimension and profile as the existing, front porch posts, railings, soffit, ceiling, and decking; like-for-like.
- Paint porch, as needed, with color to match existing.

- **17-9-35**

**592 Briggs Street**

**Anne N. Dierker (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-35, 592 Briggs Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair/Rebuild Existing Front Entrance Deck

- Remove any/all existing, deteriorated, floor decking, railings, skirting, and steps on the front entrance deck, per the submitted photographs.
- Remove and replace any deteriorated floor joists, as needed.
- Install new wood decking, railings, skirting, and steps, as needed, like-for like.
- Horizontal trim boards to be placed on the street-facing side at the top and bottom of the deck and step railings.

*Note: The front deck is an existing condition that does not impair the essential form and integrity of the main structure. This approval is for repairing in-like-kind.*

- **17-9-45**

**625 Mohawk Street**

**Jeff Ihlenfeld (Applicant)**

**Chris Martin (Owner)**

Approve Application #17-9-45, 625 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Windows

- Remove the six (6) non-original windows, including one (1) window in the front gable of the brick cottage, three (3) on the dormer, and two (2) on the rear, frame addition, per the submitted photographs.
- Install six (6) new, all wood (interior/exterior), Pella Architect Series, one-over-one, double-hung sash, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- Front gable window may be either one-over-one sash, to match existing, or two-over-two sash, to match first floor windows.

**X. OLD BUSINESS**

**XI. NEW BUSINESS**

**Article IV  
Organization**

1. As soon as convenient after the members have been appointed and approved, and annually thereafter at the regular June meeting, the Commission shall meet and organize by the election of a Chairman and a Vice Chairman.
  2. The Secretary shall be provided by the Department of Development of the City of Columbus and shall not be a member of the Commission.
- Nominations for Chair, Vice-Chair, and Treasurer for the year 2017 through June 2018.
    - Chair – Anthony Hartke nominated by Jay Panzer
    - Vice-Chair – Jay Panzer nominated by Anthony Hartke
    - Treasurer – No nominations made / Seat Remains Open

ALL NOMINATIONS APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOTE

**XII. ADJOURNMENT (7:45 p.m.)**